

STATE OF GOVERNANCE IN CAMEROON

Ministry of Economy, Planning and Regional Development

Governance Monitoring



SUMMARY

The collection of data via the Website and interviews with officials reveals that MINEPAT has strengths and areas for improvement in terms of communication, performance of its missions and its contribution to the National Development Strategy (NDS30).

Although MINEPAT's communication is intense, dense and regularly updated, very little information exists on the ministry's achievements and overall performance. The directorate with the least information is that of Cooperation. Its contribution to the NDS30 remains average (52.38%).

LEGAL PROVISIONS

Article 47 of Law No. 2018/011 of 11 July 2018 to lay down the Cameroon Code of Transparency and Good Governance in public finance management states that: (1) The administration shall make all necessary arrangements for the publication of information on public finances, within the time limits set by regulation. (2) The information provided in paragraph 1 above shall be exhaustive. It shall cover the past, present and future and cover all budgetary and extra-budgetary activities. (3) A specific instrument, adopted before the beginning of the budgetary year, shall publish the timetable to disseminate the information provided in paragraph 1 above.

The code of transparency & good Governance enshrines the need to publish all data on public finances. The publication of comprehensive information on public finances is a legal requirement and a pedagogical State action toward the citizens.

Analysis of the Website: digitisation of documents and weak digitalisation of procedures



Figure 1: MINEPAT's Website

The official MINEPAT Website <https://minepat.gov.cm/> is accessible to the public. In addition to the standard sections providing information on the Ministry's activities, it has tabs labelled "agenda" and "about the NDS30". Detailed analysis of the site's content reveals **08 key points** and **04 points of improvement**.

08 KEY POINTS:

- The Website is functional and was recently updated (June 2022). The content is updated.
- The Website is secure
- The Website's structure is of good quality. Navigation is fluid, making it easy to access information.
- Bilingualism is effective. All information is accessible both in French and English, from "menus" to "content".
- The digitisation of documents and legal texts is a reality: several strategic documents are available online (on the Website) and can be viewed or downloaded.
- The Website has a newsletter.
- The Ministry provides users with a messaging system to encourage exchanges.
- MINEPAT is innovating with its project to develop a mobile application with the aim of informing users in real time. It facilitates the collection of their concerns.

04 AREAS FOR IMPROVEMENT

- Impossibility to make appeals via the Website.
- No availability of a “**Frequently Asked Questions**” (FAQ) feature.
- Absence of information on the overall performance of the ministry. The annual performance report provides information on the performance of an administration. In the case of MINEPAT, the reports for fiscal years 2020 and 2021 are not yet published on its Website. However, the ministry publishes its Annual Performance Report on the Website <https://www.plateformeparlementaire.cm/#/loisReglement>. On this Website, only the 2019 report is available. It is concluded that MINEPAT does not publish information on its performance on the Website and does not update its data in the parliamentary platform.
- Absence of digitalisation of procedures: this reflects a low level of ownership of digitalisation within the ministry. There are several digitised documents, but the procedures are not and interaction with users is not effective. Specifically, the appeals management system and procedures should be digitised.

Incomplete information on the performance of the missions

MINEPAT’s mission is to carry out economic studies, monitor and analyse labour market developments on an ongoing basis, to ensure the development and implementation of appropriate technical instruments for macroeconomic projection and analysis works, to carry out studies on growth and competitiveness strategies for the national economy and developing policies, programmes and budgets.

MINEPAT has three main missions: Economy, Planning and Land tenure (**see Appendix 1**). At the same time, it ensures a mission of «Cooperation» with several regions and sub-regions.

In relation to the performance of its missions, two striking findings emerge: (1) the Ministry describes the missions of each structure without presenting their achievements; this is the reproduction of the detailed organisation chart; (2) it does not report on its overall performance. The following developments present the content of each mission of the Ministry as set out in the Website.

ECONOMY MISSION

In this section, the Ministry describes its missions in the field of economy, as well as the different directorates in charge of this sector.

- **Political and economic analysis:** in this tab, only the missions are described; no mention is made of the achievements.
- **Division of Forecasting and Preparation:** there is no description of this service or its achievements.
- **Public Investments:** in this tab, the ministry describes the missions of the “**programming**” department; the execution of the BIP 2022; the execution report (no content); the report on the Cameroon economy 2021 (CDMT); the project journal (no content in this section); the monthly notes (the most recent of which date from February 2022); the reference documents (no content in this section) and finally the documentation (there are documents such as: monthly notes; keys to good execution of the BIP, Priority investment projects, etc.).

- **Promoting the economy:** for this variable, the Ministry reports on potentialities and opportunities, the business climate and key indicators of the economy.
- **Documentation:** in this section, the Ministry makes available a set of documents to help identify the economic sector (studies carried out by MINEPAT, Keys to the Cameroon economy, Projects requiring funding document...). The documents are available in both official languages (French and English).

SPATIAL PLANNING/DEVELOPMENT MISSION

It is implemented by the Spatial Planning/development Directorate. This mission is presented on the Website through four variables:

- **The Ministry's spatial planning missions.**
- **Spatial Development tools:** these are developed by the Directorate of spatial planning and Development of Border Zones. The missions of this Directorate are described as well as land tenure tools (several documents are available in this section of the Website).
- **Local and regional development** is ensured by the Directorate of Infrastructures and Support for Regional and Local Development. In this tab of the Website, only the missions are described; no mention is made of its achievements, and no document is available.
- **Documentation:** In this tab, MINEPAT makes available several important documents such as: land tenure tools (27 January 2022); master plans (27 January 2022), studies (27 January 2022) etc. These documents are available in French and English.

PLANNING MISSION

The tab on the Website corresponding to this variable recalls the missions and structures that make it up.

- **Division of Foresight and Strategic Planning:** Only the missions are described and no achievements of this directorate in 2020, 2021 and mid-term (semester 2022 collapsed).
- **Division of Demographic Analysis and Migration:** no achievement of this directorate is described, only the missions are listed.
- **Vision of the Head of State for an Emerging Cameroon by 2035:** the objectives and implementation plans are available. However, no assessment of the different stages is described (03 phases in total). No information is available on the current second phase (2020-2027), whose overall objective is "to reach the level of a middle-income country (income/capita between \$3,706 and \$11,455 in terms of value in 2007)". However, the ministry provides documents explaining the vision: contribution document to the 2035 vision, MINEPAT report: cap sur la transformation structurelle de l'économie, vision 2035.
- **Growth and Employment Strategy Paper:** a description is made of the GESP with: the objectives of the growth and employment strategy, the key considerations for the implementation of the strategy, the main strategic lines for growth and employment broken down into 07 chapters as well as the related documentation.
- **National Development Strategy 2020 - 2030:** presentation of the pillars of the NDS30 with the digital version of the document, without any evaluation of the first period (2020 - 2021).
- **Documentation:** the Ministry puts in this section all the documents aimed at knowing its planning mission.

COOPERATION MISSION

The missions of the Ministry in terms of cooperation are described in this tab and they are as follows:

- **North-South cooperation:** implemented by the Directorate of North-South Cooperation and Multilateral Organisations whose missions are described on the website without its achievements.
- **Regional integration** implemented by the Directorate of Regional Integration, only the missions are described without the achievements.
- **Cooperation with emerging countries** implemented by the Division of Cooperation with Emerging Countries; only the missions are described.
- **Cooperation with the Islamic World** implemented by the Division of Cooperation with the Islamic World; only missions are described.
- **Agreements and support:** implemented by the Agreements and Conventions File Department; only the missions are described.
- **Documentation:** in this tab, a set of documents related to cooperation is made available.

Projects and Programmes

In this section, the Ministry lists all the 18 projects and programmes carried out; 3 of which are described with Web links <https://pndp.org/> , <http://www.camagro.cm/> ; <https://programme-agropoles.cm/> enabling the follow-up their achievements. These are respectively the National Participatory Development Programme (PNDP), the AGROPOLES - PA programme and the Cameroon Agricultural Competitiveness Improvement Project - ACIP. 15 out of 18 projects are listed, but without content. For the 2022 programmes and projects, a set of downloadable documents is made available.

WHAT IS BEING DONE WELL?

From the above, MINEPAT reports well on information relating to the missions of the different structures. Emphasis is placed on the availability of documents describing the field of intervention of each mission and the listing of projects carried out or requiring funding.

WHAT IS MISSING?

Although some achievements are described on the Website (03 out of the 18 announced), there is a real lack of explicit and effective information on the achievements of each directorate, the publication of monitoring, support and evaluation of projects and programmes. There is no information on the performance of the programme budget. This reflects a lack of information on the performance of MINEPAT. A few evaluations exist concerning public investment and some projects.

TABLE: SUMMARY OF THE IMPLEMENTATION OF MINEPAT'S MISSIONS

The table below provides a summary of the implementation of MINEPAT's missions

Area	Directorates/ Divisions/ Departments/ Missions	Missions delineated on the Website	Activities carried out	Performance
Economy	Forecasting and Preparation Division	Yes	No	No
	Promoting the economy	Yes	no	No
	Political and economic analysis	no	no	No
	Public investments	Yes	Yes	Yes
	Promoting the economy	Yes	Yes	No
Land-use planning	Directorate of Spatial planning and Development of Border Areas	Yes	No	No
	Directorate of Infrastructure and Regional and Local Development Support	Yes	No	No
Planning	Division of Foresight and Strategic Planning	Yes	No	No
	Division of Demographic and Migration Analysis	Yes	No	No

Area	Directorates/ Divisions/ Departments/ Missions	Missions delineated on the Website	Activities carried out	Performance
Cooperation	Directorate for North-South Cooperation and Multilateral Organisations	Yes	No	No
	by the Directorate of Regional Integration	Yes	No	No
	The Division of Cooperation with Emerging Countries	Yes	No	No
	Division of Cooperation with the Islamic World	Yes	No	No
	department of the agreements and conventions file	Yes	No	No

It can be seen that very few MINEPAT directorates and divisions publish their achievements (2/14 or 14.28%) and their performance (1/14 or 7.14%) in accordance with the requirements of Law No. 2018/011 of 11 July 2018 on the Code of Transparency and Good Governance in Public Finance Management in Cameroon. There is no visibility on the technical performance of the ministry as well as the financial performance, as no information on budgets and achievements is published. The information from the directorates is more related to their missions (13/14 or 92.85%), giving the impression that the Website is a reflection of the organisation chart and less a tool for interaction with users. Moreover, although several documents are digitised, very few procedures are digitised, which does not facilitate the provision of online services that would make it possible to gain in speed, efficiency and diligence.

MINEPAT's contribution to the NDS30

MINEPAT contributes to the NDS30 through three (3) components: decentralisation and local development, improvement of State service, economic and financial governance. The following analyses are based on interviews with MINEPAT officials conducted as part of the assessment of the state of governance in Cameroon in which *OBIV Solutions* was involved.

- **Improvement of State service:** MINEPAT has set up a programme for the maintenance of state infrastructure and the share of public contracts awarded to national operators. The following actions have not been carried out: the code of conduct for public authorities and the internal control system,

the absence of strategic management standards and the absence of a law governing the strategic planning exercise.

- **Decentralisation and local development:** it has invested in the share of ordinary state resources transferred to the decentralised local authorities (CTDs). MINEPAT has not achieved the full transfer of competences to the CTDs because the financial resources linked to the competences allocated to the CTDs have not been fully transferred; the local civil service is not yet operational; the proportion of CTDs that have put in place a framework for inclusive dialogue and the proportion of CTDs that have signed an agreement are not available
- **Economic and financial governance:** MINEPAT has carried out the following activities: The annual dissemination of statistical information (between 30 July and 31 October 2020, a calendar for the prior dissemination of Cameroon's national statistical information system was drawn up) and, on the other hand, the capacities of human resources in the area of statistics were stepped up through staff capacity-building seminars; There is a system for selecting and maturing public investment projects; The rate of implementation of the Public Investment Budget (BIP) 2020 is close to forecasts, with **92.36%** as of 31 December, out of the 100% forecast as an indicator; Borrowing is now oriented towards the national and sub-regional market; Remedies are preferred to concessional loans for projects with proven socio-economic profitability; The use of PPP is preferred; the public debt rate is under control (as of 31 December 2020 the debt rate amounted to **46.9%**, whereas in August 2021 the debt rate was **45.3%** of GDP, the country is still far from the tolerance threshold of 70% of GDP allowed in the CEMAC zone).

Several actions were not filled in and completed. The actions that have not been filled include: the gap between the actual speed and the authorised debt load; the percentage of households that are victims of corruption; the proportion of administrations that have updated their statistics; and the setting up of a national-regional-local database. The following actions were not carried out: the interest rate on loans (in 2020 this rate rose above the usual 13%); the public Gross fixed capital formation (GFCF) (**-28.9%**) declined due to the effects of the COVID-19 pandemic on the implementation of infrastructure projects; and the autonomous functioning of regulatory authorities.

Out of a total of 21 actions to be carried out in the NDS30, only 11 were effective, with an implementation rate of **52.38%**.

On its website, the Ministry recalls the main pillars of the NDS30: the structural transformation of the national economy; the development of human capital and well-being; the promotion of employment and economic integration, and governance, the decentralisation and strategic management of the state. From this presentation of the NDS30 on the Website, it can be seen that:

- There is no evaluation of the first period (2020-2021) on the Website. No assessment of the responsibilities of MINEPAT in the NDS30 has been made.
- Weak coordination of strategic steering instruments. Despite the existence of the National Development Strategy, many instruments and documents are presented successively without any analysis of coherence or priorities.

Apart from these actions, MINEPAT is also involved in several sub-objectives. These include improving the functioning of the administration, putting in place a mechanism to perpetuate the State's assets, consolidating the system for selecting and maturing public investment projects, developing an efficient statistical system, improving the business climate, controlling the public debt and optimising the regulation of the economy.

APPENDIX: MINEPAT'S REGALIAN MISSIONS

Areas of intervention	Missions
<p>In the economic sphere:</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coherence and coordination of the actions undertaken with the various international and bilateral partners within the framework of the economic recovery and revival programme; • Follow-up of the affairs of the World Bank, the European Union, the African Development Bank and the Islamic Development Bank; • Prospecting, negotiating, finalising and monitoring the execution of loan agreements and conventions; • Elaboration of the State's multiannual investment programme; • Centralisation of projects and management of the projects' bank; • Promotion of public investments; • Preparation of the medium-term expenditure frameworks and the public investment budget; • Monitoring and control of investment programmes and projects, in conjunction with the sectoral ministries and the Ministry of Finance; • Coordination of studies and monitoring of population issues; • Monitoring short, medium and long-term economic analysis; fundamental orientations and strategies for the rehabilitation and privatisation of public enterprises.
<p>In the area of spatial planning:</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coordination and implementation of land tenure studies, both at national and regional level; Drawing up standards and rules for land tenure and monitoring their application; • Monitoring and control of the implementation of national, regional or local land tenure programmes; • Monitoring of sub-regional organisations dealing with the development or preservation of the sub-regional ecosystem. • Development or land tenure missions of the national institute of statistics, the pan-African institute for development, the sub-regional institute of statistics and applied economics, the institute of training and demographic research, the central bureau of census and population studies.
<p>In terms of planning</p>	<p>MINEPAT is responsible for the government's leading projects. Its missions include carrying out economic studies, ensuring the monitoring and permanent analysis of the evolution of the labour market, ensuring the development and implementation of appropriate technical instruments for macroeconomic projections and analysis works, carrying out studies on the growth and competitiveness strategies for the national economy, and elaborating policies, programmes and public investment budgets.</p>

This document is produced by the « *Studies and Research* » department of *OBIV Solutions* on the basis of information disseminated by MINEPAT through several channels (official digital communication tools: Website, certified page) and interviews with certain officials from 10 March to 30 June 2022. This choice of information collection is based on Law No. 2018/011 of 11 July 2018 on the Code of Transparency and Good Governance in Public Finance Management in Cameroon, which obliges administrations to publish their activity reports and report on their performance. The absence of documents reporting on performance and changes brought about by the Ministry is to be deplored. The logic of means prevails over results-oriented management. The Ministry is more inclined to publish the activities carried out without indicating the major changes induced by these activities.

TABLE: PUBLIC POLICIES OF THE GOVERNANCE SECTOR AND ADMINISTRATIONS INVOLVED¹

Public policies (governance components)	Administrations concerned
Component 1: decentralisation and local development	MINFI, MINFOPRA, MINDEVEL, MINEPAT
Component 2: Strengthening the rule of law and the protection of human rights	MINCOM, MINJUSTICE; Supreme Court, SPM, CNDHL, ELECAM, MINDEF, DGSN, DGRE, Constitutional Council, MINAT, MINDDEVEL, CTD
Component 3: Improvement of the state public service	MINFOPRA, CONSUPE, MINEPAT, MINFI, MINPOSTEL, SPM
Component 4: Economic and financial governance	MINEPAT, MINMAP, MINFI, MINCOMMERCE, MINPMEESA, MINDCAF, MINHDU, CTD, CONSUPE, MINREX
Component 5: Land-use planning	MINEPAT, MINTP, MINHDU, MINDCAF
Component 6: Bilingualism, multiculturalism and citizenship	MINEDUB, MINESEC, MINESUP, MINFOPRA, CNPMB, MINAC, MINJEC

¹ Source (Extract from the National Governance strategy, 2020-2030)



7942 Yaoundé, Avenue Foch



(+237) 222232160



contact@obivsolutions.com



www.obivsolutions.com



(+237) 670 61 30 49/ 696 38 48 34

OBIV Solutions' Studies and Research Department commits to do a publication every 15th of the month until 15 December 2022.

